Metal Whiskers:

Failure Modes and Mitigation Strategies

Jay Brusse / Perot Systems
Dr. Henning Leidecker / NASA Goddard
Lyudmyla Panashchenko / Univ. of MD-CALCE Graduate Student

http://nepp.nasa.gov/whisker
Outline

• A Brief History of Metal Whiskers

• System Failure Modes Caused by Metal Whiskers

• A Few Mitigation Strategies to Reduce Harm From Metal Whiskers

• **NO WHISKER GROWTH THEORY TO BE DISCUSSED!!!**

Cover Photo: Zinc Whiskers on Hot Dip Galvanized Steel Pipe

Cover Photo: Tin whiskers on Tin-Plated Beryllium Copper PCB Card Rails

December 5, 2007

Metal Whiskers: Failure Modes and Mitigation Strategies
What are Tin or Zinc or Cadmium Whiskers?

- Hair-like structures made of a single grain, or only a few grains, that sometimes erupt from a metal. Coatings of Tin, Zinc and Cadmium are especially able to develop whiskers; but, whiskers have been seen on Gold, Silver, Lead, and other metals too.

- Growth occurs over time by accretion of metal ions at the base NOT the tip.

- LENGTH: Log-normally distributed. Rarely up to 10 mm or more. (Typically ~1 mm or less)

- THICKNESS: Range 0.006 to >10 um. (Typical ~ 1 um)

- Fundamental theories for growth mechanism DO NOT enable prediction of the time-dependence of whisker density, whisker lengths or thicknesses.
  - To be useful a theory should identify what we must control to make confident predictions.
  - Such a theory has remained elusive.

Tin Whiskers on Tin-Plated Ceramic Chip Capacitor
Metal Whiskers
“The Early Years”

• 1946:
  H. Cobb (Aircraft Radio Corp.) publishes earliest “known” account of CADMIUM whiskers inducing electrical shorting between plates of air capacitors used in military equipment. These events occurred during World War II (~1942 – 1943)

• 1952:
  Since Cadmium coatings resulted in shorting, Tin and Zinc were used instead. But then K.G. Compton, A. Mendizza, and S.M. Arnold (Bell Labs) reported shorting caused by whiskers from these coatings too!

Tin Whiskers on 1960’s Era
Variable Air Capacitor
Whisker Resistant Metal Coatings
“The Quest”

• 1950s and 60’s:
  Bell Labs worked through the periodic table, to determine whether addition of some element to a Tin coating would “quench” whiskering
  – Adding 0.5 - 1% (by weight) of lead (Pb) works
  – Some additives seem to enhance whiskering

• Since 1990s:
  Most MIL specs require adding Pb to any tin coatings used around electronics.
  – Concentration is usually named as 2% to 3% Pb by weight for “margin”

• What additives quench zinc and cadmium whiskers?
  – We don’t know, but certainly NOT chromate conversion finishes!

Zinc Whiskers Growing from Zinc-Plated Yellow Chromate Steel Bus Rail
Metal Whiskers on Components

Relays
Tin Whiskers

Computer Room Flooring
Zinc Whiskers

D-Sub Connector
Tin Whiskers

Transformer Can
Tin Whiskers

Connector
Cadmium Whiskers

Lugs
Tin Whiskers

December 5, 2007

Metal Whiskers:
Failure Modes and Mitigation Strategies

6
Guess What’s Lurking Inside?

Transistor Package is Tin-Plated Inside.

Many Vintage Radio Malfunctions Have Been Attributed to Whiskers Shunting Case to Terminals

http://www.vintage-radio.net/forum/showthread.php?t=5058
# 2006- NASA GSFC Presented

## A Partial History of Documented Metal Whisker Problems


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Application</th>
<th>Industry</th>
<th>Failure Cause</th>
<th>Whiskers on?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1946</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Cadmium Whiskers</td>
<td>Capacitor plates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1948</td>
<td>Telecom Equipment</td>
<td>Telecom</td>
<td>Cadmium Whiskers</td>
<td>Capacitor plates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1949</td>
<td>Telecom Equipment</td>
<td>Telecom</td>
<td>Cadmium Whiskers</td>
<td>Capacitor plates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1954</td>
<td>Telecom Equipment</td>
<td>Telecom</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Channel Filters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1959</td>
<td>Telecom Equipment</td>
<td>Telecom</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Channel Filters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>Apnea Monitors</td>
<td>Medical (RECALL)</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Rotary Switch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>Duane Arnold Nuclear Power Station</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1962</td>
<td>Missile Program “C”</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>Govt. Electronics</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>Telecom Equipment</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1966</td>
<td>Telecom Equipment</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1967</td>
<td>Telecom Equipment</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968</td>
<td>Aerospace Electronics</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968</td>
<td>DBS-1 (Side 1)</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>Dresden nuclear Power Station</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>GALAXY IV (Side 2)</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>F15 Radar</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972</td>
<td>Heart Pacemaker</td>
<td>Medical (RECALL)</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1973</td>
<td>MIL Aerospace</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1974</td>
<td>MIL VII (Side 1)</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>Military Aircraft</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>Nuclear Power Plant</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977</td>
<td>Commercial Electronics</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978</td>
<td>Eng Computer Center</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>SOLIDARIDAD I (Side 1)</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>South Texas Nuclear Plant</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Solis I &amp; II</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>SOLIDARIDAD II</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>POLARIS</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>MIL/Aerospace Power Plant</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>Orion</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>Phoenix Missile Station</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Microwave Electronics</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>Eng Computer Center</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>SOLIDARIDAD I (Side 2)</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>SOLIDARIDAD II</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>SOYUZ</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>SES</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>LES-1</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>MIL/Aerospace Power Plant</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Military Aircraft</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>Nuclear Power Plant</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Commercial Electronics</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Eng Computer Center</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>SOLIDARIDAD I (Side 2)</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Telecom Equipment</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>TELECOM 1 &amp; 2</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>Military Aircraft</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Nuclear Power Plant</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Commercial Electronics</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Eng Computer Center</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>SOLIDARIDAD II</td>
<td>Military</td>
<td>Zinc Whiskers</td>
<td>Power Station</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These are ~10% of the Problems We Know About

---

December 5, 2007

Metal Whiskers: Failure Modes and Mitigation Strategies
“There is a name for those who suppose that doing the same thing will produce different results. That name is ‘Idiot’.”

- Albert Einstein
Basic Whisker Failure Modes

**Electrical Short Circuits**

- Continuous short if \( I_{\text{whisker}} < I_{\text{melt}} \)
- Intermittent short if \( I_{\text{whisker}} > I_{\text{melt}} \)

**Debris/Contamination**

- Interfere with Sensitive Optics or MEMS
- Produce Shorts in Areas REMOTE From Whisker Origins
  (Zinc Whiskers on raised flooring are a PRIME Example)

**METAL VAPOR ARC**

- If \( I_{\text{whisker}} \gg I_{\text{melt}} \) Whisker Can Vaporize into a Metal Gas
- If EMF is sufficiently high, then the metal gas can be ionized into a conductive PLASMA of Metal Ions
- Plasma Can Form an Arc Capable of Carrying HUNDREDS OF AMPS! Depends on arc gap length, voltage, current, pressure, etc.
Metal Whisker Melting Current -- Pt. 1

\[ I_{melt,\text{vac}} = \left[ \frac{2\sqrt{LzT_0}}{R_0} \right] \cos^{-1}\left( \frac{T_0}{T_{\text{melt}}} \right) \]

Where \( Lz \sim 2.45 \times 10^{-8} \) (V/K)^2 is the Lorenz number, \( T_{\text{melt}} \) = melting temperature, \( T_0 \) = ambient temperature, \( R_0 \) = whisker resistance at ambient.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Material</th>
<th>( T_{\text{melt}} )</th>
<th>( I_{melt,\text{vac}} )</th>
<th>( V_{\text{melt}} = R_0 \times I_{melt,\text{vac}} )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tin</td>
<td>505.1K</td>
<td>87.5 mV / ( R_0 )</td>
<td>88 mV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cadmium</td>
<td>594.2K</td>
<td>97.1 mV / ( R_0 )</td>
<td>97 mV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zinc</td>
<td>692.7K</td>
<td>104.4 mV / ( R_0 )</td>
<td>104 mV</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If \( V_{\text{whisker}} > V_{\text{melt}} \)

Then the Whisker will Fuse Open

But there is MORE to this story

See Backup Slides for Derivation
• Metal whiskers are also coated with electrically insulating films
  – Tin oxides, Zinc oxides, moisture films, et al

• Direct MECHANICAL contact by the whisker to another conductor does NOT guarantee ELECTRICAL contact
  – For Electrical Contact, the potential difference must exceed “dielectric breakdown” of the insulating films
  – For tin and zinc whiskers, independent groups have confirmed the oxide film breakdown ranges from ~ 0.2V to ~ 45V

Electrical Current Flow through this Tin Whisker did not occur until $V_{\text{applied}} \sim 3$ V at which point the Whisker promptly melted
Sustained Metal Vapor Arcing

- Gaps shorter than a few tens of microns can support a sustained arc at potential differences of 12 to 14 volts, and currents of 0.1 to 0.3 amperes.
  - See “Electrical Contacts” by Paul G. Slade, part three

- However, as the arc gap increases, the EMF needed to sustain the arc increases, as does the current.
  - GSFC testing of FM08 style fuses with metal filaments ~5 mm long finds ~ 75 volts at more than 30 amperes is needed to generate a sustained arc across this arc gap when P ~1 torr

G. Davy, “Relay Failure Caused by Tin Whiskers”, Northrop Grumman, Technical Article, October 2002

Tin Whiskers Growing on Armature Of Relay Produced Metal Vapor Arc
How do People with “Whiskers” Cope?
My Whisker “Stress Relaxation Theory”

Man with “Facial Whiskers”
Does YOGA!

Men with “Metal Whiskers”
Find Innovative Ways to Relieve Stress
A Case for Whisker Mitigation Strategies?

Tin Whiskers on Tin-Plated Axial Leaded Diodes

- PWB and components were **NOT Conformal Coated**
- Diode Leads were **NOT Hot Solder Dipped**

Images Courtesy of T. Riccio (STPNOC)
Three Whisker Mitigation Strategies

Mitigation – to make less severe or painful
Merriam-Webster Dictionary

Risk “Mitigation” ≠ Risk “Elimination”

• Avoid Use of Whisker Prone Surface Finishes
  – Perform independent materials composition analysis
  – “Trust, But VERIFY!” using X-ray Fluorescence (XRF), Energy Dispersive X-ray Spectroscopy (EDS), et al

• Conformal Coat
  – Can slow whisker growth
  – Can block whiskers from electrically shunting distant conductors

• Remove/Replace Tin Finishes When Practical
  – Hot Solder Dip using lead-tin (Pb-Sn) solders
  – “First Do No Harm” Principle
NASA Goddard Whisker Mitigation Study
Conformal Coat (Uralane 5750* Polyurethane)
~9 Years of Office Ambient Storage

• **Specimen:**
  – 1” x 4” x 1/16” Brass 260
  – Tin-Plated 200 microinches
  – Intentional scratches created after plating

• **Conformal Coating:**
  – Uralane 5750 on ½ of sample
  – Nominal Thickness = 2 mils

• **Storage Conditions:**
  – Office Ambient ~ 9 years

*Uralane™ 5750 now known as Aralane™ 5750*
Coating Thickness Can Vary Depending on Process Parameters

NASA Test Coupons had a “transition” region ~2 mm wide where the conformal coating thickness was variable between 0 and 2 mils

One must understand their own processes to ensure the coating thickness is sufficient everywhere you intend it to be!!

* Uralane™ 5750 now known as Aralane™ 5750
Control Areas – **No** Conformal Coat  
9-Years of Office Ambient Storage

- Control Areas Grew Whiskers Abundantly
  - Avg:  $55 \pm 19.6$ whiskers / mm$^2$
  - Range: 23 to 95 whiskers / mm$^2$
Conformal Coated Areas Grew Whiskers Too

- To date ALL whiskers are contained beneath the coating that is 2 mils thick.
- With SEM we cannot see into the coating. Instead we see “domes” caused by whiskers that lift coating slightly.
- Avg: 3.4 ± 2.6 domes / mm²
- Range: 0 to 10.6 domes / mm²

We suspect we are only counting “thick” whiskers in this statistic because the “thin” ones mechanically buckle before they can lift the coating enough to produce visible “domes.”
Whisker Puncture vs. Coating Thickness

Whiskers completely contained BEHIND the coating
With nominal thickness of 2 mils

~2 mils of Uralane 5750

Decreasing Coating Thickness

Whiskers punch through in this region where Coating thickness < ~0.2 mils
Uralane 5750 Conformal Coat - 9-Years of Office Ambient Storage

2 Mils Uralane = Very Effective

~0.5 Mils Uralane = Less Effective

~0.1 Mils Uralane = Not Effective

Whiskers Completely Entrapped Under the Coating → Euler Buckling

Whisker “Lifting” Coating into Shape of Circus Tent, But Not Yet Penetrating

Whiskers Breaking Through “Thin” Coating
Euler Buckling
Axial Force Required to Buckle a Metal Whisker

\[ F_B = \frac{\pi^2 EI}{(KL)^2} \approx \left( \frac{\pi^3 \cdot E}{32} \right) \left( \frac{d^4}{L^2} \right) \]

- \( E \) = Young’s Modulus of whisker material,
- \( I \) = Area Moment of Inertia,
  (e.g. \( I = \pi d^4 / 64 \) for circular cross section)
- \( L \) = Length of whisker,
- \( K \) = Column Effective Length Factor
  - \( K = 0.5 \) for whisker fixed at both ends
  - \( K = 0.7 \) for fixed at one end, pinned at other

Conformal Coat
Conductor
“Whisker”
Whisker Growth Surface
Whiskers Lift and Peel Conformal Coat Until Whisker Buckles OR Coating Fails 
\( (F_{\text{peel}} \text{ vs. } F_{\text{Buckle}}) \)

- As whisker first emerges it is short and stiff thus \( F_B > F_{\text{peel}} \) and whisker begins to lift the coating forming a “circus tent” with height \( L = \text{length of whisker} \);

- “Tent” joins the surface at a circle of circumference \( C \sim 2\pi Q L \),
  - \( Q \) describes the details of tent-like shape

- To peel conformal coating up and away from the surface, one needs to apply a force \( (F_{\text{peel}}) \) proportional to the circumference:
  - \( F_{\text{peel}} = \Phi \times C = 2\pi Q \phi L \)

\( \Phi \) = peel strength of material which describes the adhesion of the coating to the tin, and the effect of the separation angle. It also depends on the rate at which the coating is peeled away.

Uralane 5750 has better self-cohesion than adhesion to a tin surface

Additional Analysis Pending
Will Whiskers Buckle Before Puncturing a Distant Coated Surface?

- The displacement of the conformal coat due to a whisker pushing against the coating is:

\[
D = \left( \frac{1 - \nu^2}{E_{coat}} \right) \left( \frac{F_B}{d} \right) \approx \left( \frac{\pi^3}{32} \right) \left( 1 - \nu^2 \right) \left( \frac{E_W}{E_{coat}} \right) \left( \frac{d^3}{L^2} \right)
\]

Where

- \( D \) = Displacement of conformal coat
- \( \nu \) = Poisson’s ratio
- \( E_{coat} \) = Young’s Modulus of coating
- \( E_W \) = Young’s Modulus of Whisker
- \( d \) = “Diameter” of whisker
- \( L \) = Length of whisker
- \( F_B \) = Euler Buckling Strength of the whisker

[Diagram showing a whisker penetrating a coated surface with labels for D, d, F_B, and the coating.]
Thank Goodness for Euler Buckling and Conformal Coat on this PWB!!!

These Long Whiskers Experienced Euler Buckling Before Penetrating a Distant Conformal Coated Surface

Tin Whisker “Buckling”

8.0mm

Tin Whiskers Growing from Non-Conformal Coated Card Rail

Photo Credit: M&P Failure Analysis Laboratory
The Boeing Company Logistics Depot
Effects of Conformal Coating -- 1

• Numerous sorts of coatings have been tried:
  – Reports of success vary from “none” to “perfect”, sometimes for the same sort of coating.

• NASA GSFC has used Uralane 5750, applied to pre-primed tin-plated surfaces to a thickness of 2 mils (=50 micrometers) +/- 10%:
  – After ~9 years of office ambient storage, these surfaces have whiskered abundantly, but the number of whiskers escaping through the 2 mil thick areas has been zero

• Dr. Thomas Woodrow (Boeing) has studied Urethane (acrylic) coatings, a silicone coating, and Parylene C coating of varying thicknesses up to ~ 4 mils (= 100 micrometers):
  – Some whiskers have penetrated even the thickest coatings when exposed to 25°C / 97% R.H.
Effects of Conformal Coating -- 2

• Conclusion 1:
  – Uralane 5750, applied to at least 2 mils thickness, is a substantial improvement over an uncoated surface.

• Conclusion 2:
  – It is possible to suppose the surface is protected when it is not
  – There can be “weak zones” of thin coating allowing vertical escape

• Conclusion 3:
  – Even “poor” coatings can offer some protection against a whisker coming from a distant source and attempting to contact the protected surface --- long whiskers bend easily (Euler Buckling).
  – Conformal coat protects against a conductive bridge from detached whiskers lying across a pair of conductors
Hot Solder Dip
Benefits & Limitations

Field Failure ONE Year After Assembly

Crystal with Tin-Plated Kovar Leads
(with Nickel Underplate)

Tin Whiskers (~60 mils) Grew on
NON-Dipped Region Shorting to Case
Causing Crystal to Malfunction

- Leads were Hot Solder Dipped (Sn63Pb37) within 50 mils of Glass Seal BEFORE Mounting to enhance solderability
- Dip was not 100% of leads due to concerns of inducing harm to glass seal

- No Whiskers on Hot Solder Dipped Surface
- ABUNDANT whiskers on the Non-Dipped Surface
Contact Information

Jay Brusse
Perot Systems at
NASA Goddard Space Flight Center
Jay.A.Brusse@nasa.gov

Work Performed in Support of the
NASA Electronic Parts and Packaging (NEPP) Program

Acknowledgment to Dr. Michael Osterman
University of MD – Center for Advanced Life Cycle Engineering (CALCE)

NASA Tin and Other Metal Whisker WWW Site
http://nepp.nasa.gov/whisker
Backup Slides
Tin Whiskers Forming “Circus Tents” in Thin Uralane 5750 Conformal Coat - 9-Years of Office Ambient Storage

Coating Thickness < 0.5 Mil
Tin Whiskers Rupturing THIN Coating
~0.1 to 0.2 Mils Uralane 5750 Conformal Coat
9-Years of Office Ambient Storage
A Few Recent Whisker Experiences

• **Tin Whiskers:**
  – **2005:** Connecticut Nuclear Power Plant shutdown due to Tin whiskers on diodes
  – **2006:** Space Shuttle Transportation System discovers Tin whiskers on card rails: Some 100 to 300 million whiskers were in OV-105’s boxes
  – **2006:** SWATCH reports 30% of crystals made using RoHS-compliant tin-copper solder sprouting Tin whiskers. 5% catastrophically shorted within months.

• **Zinc Whiskers:**
  – **2005:** Colorado State Government builds a new “disaster recovery center” after Zinc whiskers crippled its old data center
  – **2005:** 75% of the computer equipment in a particular data center failed due to Zinc whiskers from raised floor tiles. Root cause identified in ~8 months later
  – **2006:** Persistent NAVY weapon system failure confirmed caused by Zinc whiskers

• **Cadmium Whiskers:**
  – **2006:** Spaceflight program observes Cadmium whiskers on electrical switch
  – **2007:** Test chamber feed-thru failure caused by Cadmium whiskers on connector shells
Circuit to Measure Resistance of a Metal Whisker

- Use of a simple “Ohmmeter” to measure the resistance of a metal whisker is NOT preferred
  - Ohmmeter may supply $V_{\text{out}} < V_{\text{breakdown}}$ for the insulating films (oxides, moisture) that form on a metal whisker
  - Ohmmeter may supply $V_{\text{out}} > V_{\text{melt}}$ causing the whisker to melt before resistance can be measured

- Instead, a variable power supply and a ballast resistor should be used to overcome the above complications
  - Adjust $V_{\text{out}} > V_{\text{breakdown}}$ of insulating films on whisker
  - When $V_{\text{out}} > V_{\text{breakdown}}$, $R_B$ quickly drops $V_{\text{whisker}} < V_{\text{melt}}$

\[ R_W = \frac{V - IR_B}{I} \]

Choose $R_B$ such that $V_{\text{whisker}} < 80\% V_{\text{melt}}$
Optical Inspection for Metal Whiskers

- Basic Equipment:
  - Binocular Microscope
  - Light Source: Flex Lighting PREFERRED over Ring Lamp
- Freedom to tilt sample and/or lighting to illuminate whisker facets is VERY IMPORTANT
Evidence of “Absence of Whiskers”? (Optical Microscopy)

The absence of evidence is NOT evidence of absence

0.5-mm long tin whisker
Now You See It...

“Slight” Change in Angle of Lighting Makes this Whisker Invisible to Optical Inspection

Now You Don’t
Field Technicians and Failure Analysts Need To Be Acquainted with Metal Whiskers!!!

NASA GSFC has published videos to aid in optical inspection for metal whiskers

http://nepp.nasa.gov/whisker/video

Now You See It
Incident Angle Lighting

Now You Don’t
“Ring Light”

Small Change in Angle of Lighting Makes Dramatic Difference During Optical Inspection
Why Are Tin, Zinc, Cadmium Still Used?

- Not all Tin (or Zinc or Cadmium) surfaces whisker!
  - Rough estimate: 3% to 30% do whisker.
- Not all metal whiskers cause shorts
  - Environment (geometry and electrical potentials matter).
  - Rough estimate: 3% to 30% do short.
- Not all whisker-induced shorts are traced to whiskers
  - They are very hard to see and failure analysis techniques often destroy evidence
  - Rough estimate: 0% to 10% are correctly traced.
- Not all identified whisker adventures are reported
  - Rough estimate: 0% to 3% are reported, once identified
- Hence, we expect between 0.00% and 0.03% of shorting problems caused by these coatings to be reported
  - While some 0.1% to 10% of these coatings are actually causing shorts.
  - With such a few public cases, many say “What, me worry?”
- Whiskering is dramatically inhibited when 0.5% (or more) lead (Pb) is added to Tin coatings: the shorting rate then approaches zero
  - This has been the case for the Hi-Rel community
  - But Pb use is being restricted by international legislation, and so the shorting rate may jump to 10% from zero}
"The Five Stages of Metal Whisker Grief"

By Henning Leidecker
Adapted from Elisabeth Kubler-Ross in her book "On Death and Dying",
Macmillan Publishing Company, 1969

Denial

"Metal whiskers?!? We ain't got no stinkin' whiskers! I don't even think metal whiskers exist! I KNOW we don't have any!"

Anger

"You say we got whiskers, I rip your $%#@ lungs out! Who put them there --- I'll murderize him! I'll tear him into pieces so small, they'll fit under one of those *^&$#% whiskers!"

Bargaining

"We have metal whiskers? But they are so small. And you have only seen a few of them. How could a few small things possibly be a problem to our power supplies and equipment? These few whiskers should be easy to clean up."

Depression

"Dang. Doomed. Close the shop --- we are out of business. Of all the miserable bit joints in all the world, metal whiskers had to come into mine... I'm retiring from here... Going to open a 'Squat & Gobble' on the Keys. "

Acceptance

"Metal whiskers. How about that? Who knew? Well, clean what you can. Put in the particle filters, and schedule periodic checks of what the debris collectors find. Ensure that all the warrantees and service plans are up to date. On with life."
Derivation of Melting Current of a Metal Whisker in Vacuum

Assume both ends of Whisker are thermally grounded to $T_o$

\[
\frac{du}{dt} + \Phi = source
\]

\[
\Phi = \left( \frac{\partial J}{\partial x} \right)_x \cdot \Delta L \cdot A
\]

\[
\text{Source} = I^2 \cdot R
\]

\[
I = J_e \cdot A \\
R = \frac{\rho \cdot \Delta L}{A}
\]

\[
source = \left( J_e^2 \cdot A^2 \right) \cdot \left( \frac{\rho \cdot \Delta L}{A} \right)
\]

\[
source = \left( J_e^2 \cdot A \right) \cdot \rho \cdot \Delta L
\]

\[
I_{melt, vac} = \left[ \frac{2\sqrt{LzT_0}}{R_0} \right] \cos^{-1} \left( \frac{T_0}{T_{melt}} \right)
\]
An Example of “Melting” a Tin Whisker

Before Contact
1. Gold-Plated Test Probe has +3 Volts Relative to Tin Whisker

After Contact
1. Tip of whisker micro-welds to gold test probe
2. Whisker melts mid-length
3. Small section of whisker root remains attached to substrate